

philippine studies

Ateneo de Manila University • Loyola Heights, Quezon City • 1108 Philippines

Nineteenth-Century Ecclesiology

Review Article: C. G. Arevalo

Philippine Studies vol. 10, no. 4 (1962): 724—729

Copyright © Ateneo de Manila University

Philippine Studies is published by the Ateneo de Manila University. Contents may not be copied or sent via email or other means to multiple sites and posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's written permission. Users may download and print articles for individual, noncommercial use only. However, unless prior permission has been obtained, you may not download an entire issue of a journal, or download multiple copies of articles.

Please contact the publisher for any further use of this work at philstudies@admu.edu.ph.

<http://www.philippinestudies.net>
Fri June 30 13:30:20 2008

the people he saw and knew on his way to the State University of Iowa as an exchange student in 1950. Valdemar Olaguer contributes the only poem in the issue, "From a Bird in a Cage on Its Way to Pasay City."

BIENVENIDO LUMBERA

NINETEENTH-CENTURY ECCLESIOLOGY

DE CORPORE CHRISTI MYSTICO SIVE DE ECCLESIA CHRISTI THESES. DIE EKKLESIOLOGIE DES KONZILSTHEOLOGEN CLEMENS SCHRADER S.J. Edited, with introduction, notes and commentary by Heribert Schauf. Freiburg im Breisgau: Herder, 1959, Pp. xii-484.

Monsignor Heribert Schauf, *subregens* of the major seminary at Aachen and a consultant of the preparatory theological commission of Vatican Council II, has worked extensively and deeply in the area of nineteenth-century theology and is surely one of the leading contemporary specialists in this field. His doctorate dissertation on nineteenth-century Catholic theological teaching on the divine indwelling in souls, *Die Einwohnung des Heiligen Geistes* (Freiburg i. Br.: Herder, 1941), focused special attention on the "Roman school" theologians (professors at the Roman College, now better known as the Pontifical Gregorian University), especially on Carlo Passaglia (1812-1887) and Clemens Schrader (1820-1875). In later studies, among them the article "Germanikertheologen des 19. Jahrhunderts, die Theologie in deren Sicht" (*Korrespondenzblatt für die Alumnus des Collegium Germanicum-Hungaricum*, 59, Rom 1952, Heft 2, pp. 152-167) and the valuable introduction and notes to his edition of Matthias Joseph Scheeben's *Handbuch der Katholischen Dogmatik*, 6. Buch, *Gnadenlehre* (Freiburg i. Br.: Herder, 1957), he has perseveringly pursued his investigation of the Passaglia-Schrader *corpus theologicum*. Teachers and students of the theology of the Church will especially welcome Schauf's two new contributions to the history of nineteenth-century ecclesiology: the first, *Die Ekklesiologie des Konzilstheologen Clemens Schrader* (which will be the object of this review); the second, *De Conciliis Oecumenicis: Theses Caroli Passaglia* (Romae: Herder, 1961), really a sort of enchi-ridion of documents pertaining to ecumenical councils.

The Schrader opus, a handsome and imposing tome of about 500 pages, after a lengthy introduction (pp. 1-45) on Schrader's life and theological work and on the published and unpublished Schrader-

material extant, reproduces the Latin text of Schrader's first 28 *de ecclesia Christi* theses (of the 86 in the complete work) together with Schrader's own exposition, notes and scriptural, patristic, etc. citations, as established by Schauf from the text of the hitherto unpublished manuscript *Archivum Pont. Univ. Greg.* (APUG) 1534, discovered by Fr. Sebastian Tromp of the Gregorian University some twenty-five years ago in the archives of the Roman province of the Society of Jesus. These theses are the by-product of Schrader's 1866 lectures at the University of Vienna, where he taught from 1857 to 1867; a catalogue of them was first issued in 1869 in the *Theses Theologicae* series published by Mayer in Vienna. Schauf's edition not only gives Schrader's own fuller development of each of his theses, but joins to them his (Schauf's) own abundant notes, which often reproduce at length pertinent material from the Roman College theologian's other published works and still unpublished mss., as well as material from other authors and copious bibliographical references.

The present work is meant to be the first volume of three, and covers the first two sections of Schrader's treatise on the Church: I, *theoretikon*, on the Church as Christ's mystical Body (Theses 1-9) and II, *pragmatikon*, a "sociological" consideration of the nature of the ecclesiastical society (Theses 10-28). Three further sections: III, *aitiatikon*, on the various causes of the Church (Theses 29-71), IV, *ontologikon*, on her prerogatives and properties (Theses 72-83) and V, *logikon*, on her distinguishing notes (Theses 84-86) remain to be published. In a highly laudatory review in *Gregorianum* (XLI/1962, pp. 324-326), Fr. Tromp reports that the material for the two succeeding volumes — a *multis ardentius exoptata*, he says — is now ready and only awaits the munificence of some Maecenas to see the light of day.

One reason for special interest in Schrader's ecclesiological work stems from the fact that Schrader was primarily responsible for the text of the *primum schema de ecclesia Christi* which was presented to the Fathers of Vatican Council I. (It is principally due to Schauf's own research that the fact of Schrader's primary authorship has been established.) It will be recalled that the *primum schema* begins with the notion of the Church as Christ's mystical Body, a notably different approach at a time when the theology of the Church was considered — to borrow Fr. Congar's term — almost exclusively as a "hierarchiology", almost exclusively as a defense of the hierarchical constitution and powers of the Church.

It is the Pauline notion of the Church as Christ's body which is the commanding theme of Schrader's treatise on the Church. The first part of the work devotes nine theses to this idea, and these nine theses are perhaps the most valuable — they are certainly the most

original — ones in this first volume. Schrader starts off by considering the “other body” of Christ spoken of in the Scriptures and the Fathers, and the name “mystical” as ascribed to that body. He goes on to study the nature of this mystical Body as an “organism” vivified by Christ’s own Spirit and as a continuation of Christ’s life on earth, its structure as patterned on the union of divine and human in the Incarnate Word. The identification is then established (Thesis 7) between the Church and Christ’s mystical Body: one reality, essentially unchanging, perpetually enduring and, *secundum analogiam*, made up of body and soul, on pilgrimage on earth to eternal life.

Theses 4 and 5 might be considered typical of Schrader’s approach. Thesis 4 (pp. 100 ff.) states that the life of the mystical Body is Christ’s own life; that Christ prolongs His own earthly existence in His “other” Body; that He continues in it the visible economy of the Word, so that there exists an analogy between Christ’s own being, operation and life, and the mystical Body’s nature, activity and *stadia* of existence. Thesis 5 (pp. 120 ff.) states that in spite of the variety of function, grade and condition which obtains among the members of Christ’s Body, a true union, a real communion exists between them all; that somewhat as the humanity which was assumed by the Word is referred to Him, so is the new and redeemed humanity referred to Christ; that in the mystical Body the divine and human, the internal and external elements are distinct but indivisibly and inseparably conjoined. These ideas are developed largely by a series of scriptural citations and by theological reasoning which leans above all on Johann Adam Moehler’s great patristic themes.

All this may not seem particularly striking to those brought up in post-*Mystici Corporis* ecclesiology, in which these ideas are relatively common, but even a superficial acquaintance with manuals of the last hundred years will indicate that this was far from being standard procedure in the treatises of the mid-1800’s. (Cf. in the published volume of the Strasbourg 1959 colloquium on 19th-century ecclesiology, the studies by Canon Aubert and — above all — Fr. Congar, *L’Ecclesiologie au XIXe. siècle* [Editions du Cerf: Paris, 1960], pp. 11 ff. and 77 ff.)

If we may be allowed a brief digression at this point: the first Vatican Council did not, we know, issue a definition of the Church as Christ’s mystical Body, as Schrader’s *primum schema* had suggested it might. It was the late Roman Pontiff, Pope Pius XII, who was to say, almost a century later, that no name for the Church is “nobler, more excellent, more divine” than that of “mystical Body of Christ” (AAS 34/1943, 199). The theologian who revised the *primum schema*, J. Kleutgen, was to note that “the symbolic definition of the Church as Christ’s Body did not find favor with many of the Very Reverend

Fathers [of the Council]" (*Mansi*, LIII, p. 319). We might remark here that in a recent, and really excellent, study of Vatican I, the Dominican theologian Jean-Pierre Torrell points out that Kleutgen's statement needs to be corrected. By actual "nose count", conducted through the *acta* of the council, it can in fact be said that the majority of the conciliar Fathers of Vatican I were favorable to the idea of defining the Church as Christ's mystical Body: 53 Fathers against, 54 Fathers for, plus some 22 other Fathers who can be lined up in the *pro*-column. Torrell is thus inclined to believe that the late Emile Mersch "does not go beyond the truth when he holds that the greater part of the ordinary *magisterium* did not object to making the doctrine of the Mystical Body the center of the treatise on the Church" (*La théologie de l'épiscopat au premier Concile du Vatican*, Unam Sanctam, 37. Editions du Cerf: Paris, 1961, p. 253, note 1). The hope — some have said, the almost certain hope — has been repeatedly voiced that Vatican II will make this definition one of the first items on its doctrinal program.

The second part of the present volume, on the Militant Church, begins with an introductory section (*protheoria*) on human society in general, its nature, its different types, its purpose, authority within the various kinds of society (Theses 10-15). These sociological notions are then applied — a procedure customary in nineteenth-century manuals — to the Church (Theses 16-28): the Church is a society *sui generis*, but a true society, founded by Christ; there are certain consequences which derive from this, with regard to the nature of the Church, and with regard to the Church's relations with civil society. Justus Henning Boehmer (1674-1749) from Hanover, who wrote an important six-volume *Ius Ecclesiasticum Protestantium* (Halle, 1756 ff.), is referred to in the enunciation and exposition of several of these theses (e.g., Theses 18, 22, 24), and his doctrine is a special object of refutation. (It is interesting to note, incidentally, that Schrader was himself from Itzum near Hildesheim, in Hanover.) Boehmer was one of the major exponents of the territorialistic system which wished to subordinate the Church entirely to the State. His name, as an "adversary", frequently occurs also, as Schauf shows, in the preparatory discussions and annotations of the *primum schema de ecclesia* of Vatican I.

The theses in this second part are, as has been suggested above, developed along the lines customary in the "classic" nineteenth-century manuals, but some of Schauf's notes in this part of the book will be found especially interesting. Thesis 25, on the distinction between Church and State, is especially full, and in his commentary Schauf appends Schrader's hitherto unpublished *votum* "De societate civili" (pp. 385-388) and his two other *schemata* on the relationship between Church and State (pp. 396-408).

It has already been remarked that Schauf's notes are abundant. For instance, Schrader's third thesis takes up only four pages (pp. 81-84) in the present edition. Schauf's commentary runs to nearly fifteen pages of fine print (pp. 85-99), mostly devoted to a thorough-going discussion of the realist-somatic concept (Tr. Schmidt, K. Pelz *et al.*) of Christ's presence in the Church, in the course of which the positions of some twenty theologians and exegetes (e.g., T. Tschipke, Schmaus, K. Adam, J. Reuss, Cerfaux, Schlier, K. L. Schmidt) are touched on and frequently illustrated with citations from their works. Another instance: Schrader's ms. APUG 1534 gives only the wording of Thesis 18 (directed against Protestant ideas on the Church as a true society); the exposition of the thesis has been lost. Schauf fills in the lacuna with thirty pages of notes (pp. 246-276), containing very full extracts from the work of the Protestant authors envisaged by the thesis. In fact, in the notes one often enough finds what amounts to a good bibliography of the subjects which are considered, rather full presentations of the present *status quaestionis* and invariably well-informed discussions of various contemporary questions in the theology of the Church. Further, to cite Tromp, "Schauf not only considers those authors, Catholic and non-Catholic, who wrote on these ecclesiological questions in and before Schrader's time; he also collates Schrader's theses with the Vatican Council's first *schema de ecclesia Christi* and thus points out the paths which have led, *via* the encyclical letter *Mystici Corporis*, to the disputed questions of more recent times."

What has been here said will sufficiently indicate the value of Schauf's book as a reference work, one of real importance for the history of theology in the last hundred years, as well as for the study of the current concerns and the speculative problems of ecclesiology. It makes difficult reading, to be sure: Schrader's own work, as his *quondam* pupil at Rome, the theologian M. J. Scheeben, once wrote (in *Literarische Handweiser*, 1869, cited by Schauf, pp. 44-45), was characterized by a wide knowledge of Christian tradition, by a very rich philological, historical, philosophical and theological culture (unusual for his time), by a precision of concept and formulation, by a massive erudition — fruit of long years of painstaking and indefatigable research. These undeniable virtues were, however, (Scheeben also pointed out) joined to a laboriousness and heaviness of style and method, whose attention to detail and stiffness of expression made his pages rather forbidding reading. But the intrinsic merits of Schrader's work give it an enduring value: it is, all of it, solid work, scrupulously carpentered, by one of the most competent and best-informed theologians of the past century, one whose contribution to the theological progress of his time is only now being properly recognized. Surely a debt of gratitude is owing to Msgr. Schauf for

making Schrader better known to us and rescuing his work from the obscurity in which it had too long been hidden.

For those interested in the theology of the Church and the history of theology, this volume will more than recommend itself. The presentation of the work, by Herder, meets in every way this distinguished firm's standard of publishing excellence. We can only second the hopes which have been expressed that Msgr. Schauf will find, in the midst of his other concerns, the leisure and the means to bring to successful completion the publication of the two other volumes which will give us the rest of Schrader's treatise. Meanwhile, we renew our thanks to the learned Monsignor for the painstaking effort which has gone into the editing of this impressive book, surely an *opus omni dignum laude*.

C. G. ARÉVALO

ANATOMY OF AN ELECTION

THE MAKING OF THE PRESIDENT, 1960. By Theodore H. White. New York: Atheneum Publishers, 1961. ix, 400 pp.

It is said that politics is one of the most difficult things to forecast. For the actions of men cannot be measured in exact, mathematical terms. Nowhere is this belief better proven than in this account of the American presidential election of 1960 by Theodore H. White. In reporting the events, however, and in analyzing the factors that shaped the outcome of the 1960 election, the author has in fact produced a contemporary historical narrative.

Armed with a massive array of facts, and evincing a keen insight into the causes behind these facts, Theodore White traces (as only a veteran journalist can) the course of the 1960 presidential election, from its earlier pre-convention stirrings to the complicated processes of the nominations, from its shakier beginnings to the much publicized television debates and the final sounds of political battle.

The pre-convention maneuvers are a silent study in contrast, both as to the various avenues to the presidential nominations and the varied personalities of the candidates. Just what was the achievement of John F. Kennedy, and what was its significance? In White's words,

He and his men had planned . . . a campaign that seemed utterly preposterous—to take the youngest Democratic candidate to offer himself in this century, of the minority Catholic faith, a man burdened by wealth and controversial family, relying on lieutenants scarcely more than boys, and make him President.